**December 21, 2015, State Department production – 22 pages**

Sought from State:

(1) “[**V]ideos** depicting the United States Consulate in Benghazi, Libya (including the

Special Mission Compound and the Annex) between September 10, 2012 and September 12” Complaint ¶ 116(2).

(2) “[**S]urvivors' accounts**” of the attacks. Complaint ¶ 116(3).

(3) “[**R]adio communications** emanating from the Compound's Tactical Operations

 Center” during the attack. Complaint ¶ 116(4).

(4) “**Clinton's actions and communications for the 24-hour period** beginning

 when first notified” of the attack. Complaint ¶ 116(6).

(5) Records “regarding **meetings between** Christopher Stevens or any other Tripoli

 **Embassy official**, and one or more of the following [**nine] individuals**…”

Complaint ¶ 116 (11).

Ahmed Abu Khattala

Mustafa Abdul Jalil

Mahmoud Jibril

Wissam bin Hamid

Abdelhakim Belhadj (aka Abdallah al Sadeq)

Ismael al-Sallabi

Ali al-Sallabi

Mohammad al-Sallabi

Abu Sufian bin Qumu

(6) Records “regarding Secretary of State **Clinton's recommendations** regarding

U.S. support to those seeking to oust forces loyal to Colonel Muammar **Gaddafi**

and his government.” Complaint ¶ 122(1).

(7) “Records generated from March of 2011 through September of 2012, regarding

 Secretary of State **Clinton's recommendations** to support those seeking to oust

 forces loyal to the government of Bashar **al-Assad**.” Complaint ¶ 122(2).

December 21, 2015, State Case No. F-2014-06532

19 pages

25 documents

1 released in full

10 released in part

5 withheld in full

9 referred to other agency

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Bates** | **Date** | **Pages** | **Doc ID No.** | **Exemption** | **ID, summary, quotes** | **Analysis** |
| 1 |  |  |  |  | Cover letter |  |
| 2 |  |  |  |  | Same |  |
| 3 |  |  |  |  | Same |  |
| 4 | Aug 16, 2011 | 2 | Doc No. C05582999 | Released in part (b)(6) Personal privacy information | *Cable*From: Keshap, KarenSubject: Approval: Travel no BenghaziOn August 16,2011, Under Secretary for Management Patrick Kennedy approved the following USDHemployees for travel into Benghazi, Libya:State/NEA Feltman Jeffrey Assistant Secretary*, 8/17/2011-*8/21/2011*,* Consultations with Special Representative Stevens and meetings with the Transitional National Council.Slate/NEA/MAG Roebuck William Office Director*8/17/2011-*8/21/2011Accompanying A/S Feltman for consultationsNSS Fishman Benjamin Director, *8/17/2011-*8/21/2011*,* Accompanying A/S Feltman for consultationsState/NEA Hulse Jeffrey Staff Assistant, *8/17/2011-*8/21/2011*,* Accompanying A/S Feltman for consultations USAID/OFDA Myer Jock USAID/OFDA*, Regional Advisor 9/8/2011-*9/18/2011*,*Monitor current OFDA programs and meet with implementing partners, monitor and report on the humanitarian situation, and make recommendations for future humanitarian funding, if needed. USAID/OTI personnel Erica Kaster and Camara Garrett will alternate their departures from Benghazi, allowing him to fill one existing USAID slot.State/lRM/REACH Tarr Bradley, REACH Project Telecommunications Analyst, Senior Principal 8*/29/2011-*9/4/2011*,* Install VSAT, run OpenNet and ClassNet connectivity into Villa B office building. Institutional Contractor, carries diplomatic passport.State/NEA/Libya Tilou Patrick Reporting Officer departing 8/24/ 11 You approved Patrick Tillou's travel | Not enough information to determine responsiveness |
| 5 |  |  |  |  | on 7/20 with an anticipated stay from 817/2011-8121/2011. Chris Stevens requests that he be permitted to overlap with Nathan Tek for 3 days, until August 2-4. Patrick is control officer and principal notetaker for AJS Feltman's visit. Feltman departed on 8/21; Patrick would remain on compound for the duration of the overlap to draft the memcons from Feltman's meetings. His presence would not require additional assets. AIC [REDACTION] is ok with this overlap and there is sufficient beds. State/H Rademacher Paul Legislative Management Officer 8/31/2011-9/1/2011 Accompanying Senate Appropriations Committee staffer Paul Grove |  |
| 6 | Sept. 11, 2012 | 3 | C05584012 | Released in part (b)(6) Personal privacy information | *CABLE*From: AMEMBASSY TRIPOLIBENGHAZI WEEKLY REPORT - SEPTEMBER 11, 20121. (SBU) **Summary**: This is Benghazi's weekly round-up of political, economic. and social issues not included in previous reporting.2, **(SBU) Benghazi Local Council Welcomes the Ambassador**: Members of Benghazi's Local Council told the Ambassador about their frustrations with the slow pace of reforms instituted by the Transitional National Council (TNC) and its successor, the General National Congress (GNC). Members…\*\*\*3. (SBU) [REDACTION]**discusses security situation, dissolution of the SSC, extra-judicial killings of former****regime security officers, political aspirations of militia leaders, reintegration of revolutionaries, and welfare of Iranian Red Crescent detainees**: In a September 2 meeting with Acting Principal Officer Benghazi, [REDACTION] told us that senior Interior Ministry authorities had unceremoniously ended the "state of maximum alert" announced in Benghazi on August 29. The alert came amid fears of potential strikes by ex-regime supporters to mark the September 1, 1969, revolution and Qadhafi 's rise to power, [REDACTION]said. He continued that reintegrating revolutionaries remained a priority [REDACTION] and he expects that the SSC and **militias would gradually dissolve** (but not until a legitimate alternative for maintaining security emerged). [REDACTION] expressed growing frustration with police and security forces (who were too weak to keep the country secure) and commented that the Iranian Red Crescent detainees are still held by "unknown" kidnappers but in good accommodations). He speculated about possible motivations for the ongoing extra -judicial killings of interior ministryofficials (personal vendettas, criminality, tribal conflicts, purge of pro-Qadhafi officials), and he noted indications that a | *POTENTIAL CANDIDATE FOR IN CAMERA INSPECTION*Responsive to records “regarding meetings between Christopher Stevens or any other Tripoli Embassy official, and one or more of the following individuals… Mahmoud Jibril…” Compl. ¶ 116 (11).  |
| 7 |  |  |  |  | few key brigade commanders, who have been seeking government positions in security ministries, may be developing higher political and economic aspirations. (More details septel)**4. (SBU) Militia commanders discuss the Muslim Brotherhood, Jibril, their political aspirations, the economy and security**. In a September 9 meeting, local militia commanders REDACTED discussed the very **fluid relationships and blurry lines they say define membership in Benghazi-based brigades** under the February 17, Libya Shield, and SSC umbrellas. REDACTED They debated - hotly and without resolution - about which brigades supported or opposed specific causes. They claimed to exercise "control" over Libyan Armed Forces Chief of Staff Yousef Mangoush, who depends on them to secure eastern Libya. In times of crisis, Mangoush has no other choice than to turn to their brigades for "help," they said, as he did recently with unrest in Kufra. **As part of this arrangement, Mangoosh often provides the brigades direct stocks of weapons and ammunition, they said**. REDACTED **support of the Libyan Muslim Brotherhood's Justice and Construction Party backed candidate Minister of Electricity Awad Al Barasi for Prime Minister and said that, if elected, al-Barasi would appoint Fawzi Bukatif, Commander of the February 17 Brigade, as Minister of Defense. Bukatif's appointment would open the MOD and other security ministries and offices to plum-appointments for his most favored brigade commanders - giving February 17 and Libya Shield tacit control of the armed forces**. They criticized the USG for "supporting" National Forces Alliance (NFA) leader and Prime Minister candidate Mahmoud Jibril. **If Jibril won, they said, they would not continue to guarantee security in Benghazi**, a critical function they asserted they were currently providing. **Growing problems with security would discourage foreign investment** and led to persistent economic stagnation in eastern Libya, **but the USG could play a role by "pressuring" American businesses to invest** in Benghazi.*Other Benghazi news*  |  |
| 8 |  |  |  |  | *Other Benghazi news* 9. (58U) **Ambassador to Open American Space Benghazi**: The Ambassador will launch American Space Benghazi, a public platform for cultural and educational outreach by U.S. Mission Libya. The American Space will contain a small library, computer tab, and open space for programming. Embassy Tripoli will support the center with regular programs and speakers. We have already used the space to engage in dialogue with 15 young adults about U.S. foreign policy in the country and Libya's political transition. *Other Benghazi news* 11. (SBU) UK Presence: **British Charge d'Affairs Gill Frasier visited U.S. Mission Benghazi during a September 5 trip** to determine whether conditions were appropriate for tile re-opening the consulate sometime in October The British withdrew their presence from Benghazi after the widely reported June 11 RPG attack on the British Ambassador's motorcade. Signature: STEVENSDrafted By: POL-ECON: McFarlan, David CCleared By: EXEC: Hicks, Gregory NApproved By: EXEC: Stevens John C Released By: TRIPOLI: Pickens, Amber RInfo: \*\*\*CIA WASHINGTON DC *ROUTINE*\*\*\*DEPT OF JUSTICE WASHINGTON DC *ROUTINE*\*\*\*ARAB ISRAELI COLLECTIVE *ROUTINE* \*\*\*  |  |
| 9 | Sept. 27, 2012 | 2 | Doc No. C05609767 | Released in part (b)(6) privacy(b)(5) deliberative process | *EMAIL*From: Sayles, Ambrose GSubject: Re: INPUT REQUESTED: Benghazi Query from Washington Postcc: *seven recipients, one* [REDACTION]EX and OS Colleagues-We received an inquiry earlier today from the Washington Post with some questions on Libya and Ambassador Stevens' time in Benghazi. Please see the below points originally provided by the journalist as a list of "facts."[REDACTION]We are looking to get back to the journalist first thing tomorrow morning. | Not responsive |
| 10 |  |  |  |  | - The U.S. mission in Benghazi was not yet an official consulate. It was a temporary facility staffed by the Bureau of Conflict and Stabilizations Operations and other staff deployed on a temporary basis.- The building was not in compliance with State building and safety standards for permanent missions abroad. It received waivers because the facility was a temporary hub and because establishing a U.S. presence in eastern Libya was seen as a high priority.- State signed a $387,413 security contract with British firm Blue Mountain in May. The company was tasked with hiring local guards for the compound. - In May, Africom dispatched a team of 20 or so service members to Libya to help establish a security infrastructure at the embassy in Tripoli. A contingent that size remains in place, but it has been under State authority since July. That team was not asked to assist with bolstering infrastructure at the compound in Benghazi.- The first location targeted Sept. 11 was the so-called consulate. Stevens and Smith were killed there. A group of Americans were evacuated to a second site, more than a kilometer away, that has been described as an annex. That site was a CIA facility. Doherty and Woods died defending it. They were agency security contractors**.**   |  |
| 11 | Sept. 27, 2012 | 2 | Doc o. C05609769 | Released in part (b)(5) deliberative process, (b)(6) privacy re email addresses  | Email correspondence from Washington Post to Victoria Nuland re info given by State, with follow-up questions.  | Not responsive (b)(5) doubtful |
| 12 |  |  |  |  | Same |  |
| 13 |  |  |  |  | Same |  |
| 14 | Sept. 27, 2012 | 1 | Doc No. C05609786 | Released in part (b)(6) privacy re email addresses | *Email*From: Thompson, Rebecca B (PACE) [mailto:TbompsonRB2@state.gov \*\*\*[REDACTION]cc: \*\*\*[REDACTION]Subject: Update on where the story is going 4\_ Protest in Cairo, Violent Protest and Deaths in BenghaziColleagues,RRU Analyst Kathryn Nute has been monitoring international media, and as of now, here's how she summarizes wherethe story is going:International observers are criticizing US domestic political responses to the Benghazi attack and forecast possible effects of the incident upon the upcoming presidential election. The UK's *BBC* headlines "Romney's Libyan Gamble," cautioning that Romney is "taking a big risk using these tragic attacks to further this political argument." Another piece from the *BBC* asks "Could the Benghazi deaths affect the US elections?" Also in the UK, a *Guardian* commentary by Glenn Greenwald rails against what he calls "America's hierarchy of human life" as well as the "ludicrous and hypocritical" standard by which "the two political parties in the US wasted no time in displaying their vulgar attributes by rushing to squeeze these events for political gain." Russia's *RT* headlines"Clinton and Obama's shock over Libya violence 'naive'." Another piece from the UK's *The Guardian* headlines"Libyan attack: it should have been clear deposing Gaddafi was the easy bit" with the tagline "The west has once again started a fire it cannot extinguish, with the revolution it fanned in danger of degenerating into chaos."RRU will continue to monitor traditional and social media and send special reports as new major stuff comes up.Best regards,Rebecca | Not responsive "where the story is going" all about election |
| 15 | Undated—may be Sept. 11, 2012 | 1 | Doc No. C05609800 | Released in part(b)(1) specifically authorized by EO to be kept secret in interest of national defense or foreign policy, EO 13526 re foreign relations or activities of US including confidential sources (1.4(d)) | The Secretary's Call Sheet for[REDACTION](C) Background: Armed extremists attacked U.S. Mission Benghazi on September II, setting fire to the Principal's Office and killing on Mission staff member, IMO Sean Smith, on TDY from The Hague.[REDACTION] | Not enough information to determine responsiveness |
| 16 |  | 2 | Doc No. C05867375 | Released in part(b)(5) deliberative process | Email correspondence between Alyce Abdalla and Jonathan Rose and Wa'el Alzayat providing edits to "the Libya part of the AA"-- "Egypt input is attached"  | Not enough information to determine responsiveness |
| 17 |  |  |  |  | Same  |  |
| 18 | May 5, 2011 | 1 | Doc No. C05890685 | Released in full | BENGHAZI SITUATION REPORT COVER SHEET OPERATIONS CENTERRemarks: S/E Stevens update as delivered to Emb. Tripoli DCA Joan Polaschik  | Cover sheet seemingly relaying Stevens memo page 20 below  |
| 19 | April 28, 2011 | 1 | Doc No. C05890687 | Released in part(b)(6) privacy | SES\_DutyDeputies…cc: Feltman…[REDACTED email addresses]Subject: S/E Stevens' mtg with TNC chairmanPlease find attached a summary of S/E Stevens' April 27 meeting with TNC Chairman Mustafa Abel aI-Jalil. | Email forwarding Stevens memo page 20 below |
| 20 | May 2, 2011 | 1 | Doc No. C05890686 | Released in part(b)(6) privacy—email addresses | *Email*Subject: S/E Stevens Update from Benghazi – May 2, 2011Dear Colleague,Embassy Tripoli DCM Joan Poloschik asked that we forward to you the following update fromSpecial Envoy Chris Stevens from 1200 today.Dear Colleagues,**TNC/Tunisia**: TNC Coordinator for Foreign Affairs Ali Essawi is in Tunisia, reportedly to discuss the possibility of transferring arms to western Libya through Tunisia. He also will discuss a proposal to start regular flights between Tunis and Benghazi. (The TNC has control of 2-3 planes formally operated by Libyan Airlines.)- **Jlbril**: TNC PM-equivalent Mahmoud Jibril will brief all foreign envoys, including Chris, tomorrow morning. Jibril will immediately depart for Europe following that meeting and is not expected to spend significant time in Benghazi. Rumors are circulating thatEssawi may take over some executive responsibilities in a newly appointed deputy PM position.- **Arms dealers**: TNC informed Chris that two American citizens, representing a company called "BGI," have approached the TNC with an "arms for oil" deal. TheTNC refused the deal, and noted that these kinds of approaches are leaving a very bad impression. Chris commented that he is aware of other arms merchants, mostlyBritish citizens, plying Benghazi with similar offers.- **Civil Society**: Poloff Nathan Tek met today with the leader of a newly formed civil society umbrella organization, which includes 49 NGOs. Report to follow. | Responsive to records “regarding meetings between Christopher Stevens or any other Tripoli Embassy official, and one or more of the following individuals… Mahmoud Jibril…” Compl. ¶ 116 (11).  |
| 21 | April 27, 2011 | 2 | Doc No. C05890688 | Released in part (b)(1) national defense or foreign policy under EO for (1) foreign government information or (2) foreign relations or activities of US including confidential sources | *Memo*Meeting with the TNC chairman Abd al-Jalil 1. (SBU) Summary: In an hour long meeting with US Rep to the TNC on April 27. Transitional National Council chairman Mustafa Abd al-Jalil expressed his appreciation for US support and predicted that the recent uptick in NATO activity would lead to Qadhafi's removal from power.[REDACTION]He thanked the US for its efforts to end Libyan state broadcasts. Regarding internal affairs, he said the Council would expand the interim cabinet to include a deputy prime minister and ministers of defense and interior, among other portfolios. End summary.Military matters [REDACTION]Broadcasting. and economic issues- 4. (SBU) Briefed on US efforts to curtail Libyan state broadcasting. Abd al-Jalil said that cutting off such broadcasting would reduce Qaddafi's military effectiveness "by 70 percent." Persuading Arabsat and Nilesat to stop broadcasting was key. On economic matters, he said that his finance "'minister"' Ali Tarhouni was in Doha meeting with experts from the UK, France, Italy, and Qatar on the mechanics of the Temporary Financial Mechanism and on ways to tap frozen Libyan state assets. He emphasized that the TNC wanted a "transparent" mechanism to avoid the mistakes that were made in Iraq. If the TNC obtained sufficient funding, it would be able to increase services to the people and pay the scholarships | Responsive to records “regarding meetings between Christopher Stevens or any other Tripoli Embassy official, and one or more of the following individuals… Mahmoud Jibril…” Compl. ¶ 116 (11).  |
| 22 |  |  |  |  | of the thousands of Libyan students overseas that had been cut off by the regime (Comment: this is a particular concern of Abd al-Jalil's. which he raised with Senator McCain as well. End comment).5. (SBU) On the oil sector, he said that the main problem was protecting the oilfields in eastern Libya from attack by Qadhafi's forces. [REDACTION](Comment: Gadhafi's forces attacked to critical oil facilities on April 4 – Sarir and Mesiah - putting them out of commission. The Benghazi-based, Libyan oil company AGOCO has done a damage assessment and believes it can repair the major damage within weeks, but believes it is essential to have a security arrangement in place first. End comment).More Governance [REDACTION]Comment7.(S8U) Abel al-Jalil is genuinely grateful for what he sees as a recent positive shift in the level of US support for the Libyans W 0 are fighting against Qadhafi's regime. He believes that with US backing, others will follow. Despite relentless shelling of Misurrata, he appeared confident that people in the western cities would soon rise up again. Continued NATO strikes and arming those resisting the regime will protect civilians and hasten the regime's end, in his view.[REDACTION] |  |