Roger Hall, et al. v. Central Intelligence Agency

FOIA/PA Request No.:	F-2003-00449	
Document Number:	Item 5 Coord: C03336699	
Date of Document:	October 29, 1971	
Document Type:	Memo	
Classification:	Secret	
From/To:	CIA/Kissinger	
Subject:	Info about Vietnamese Prisoner Exchange Overture	
Document Pages:	51	
FOIA Exemptions: (b)(1) properly classified inf (b)(1) foreign government in (b)(1) foreign relations or fo (b)(1) intelligence activities	nformation oreign activities of the US (including special activities)	Olisposition O Denied Partial O Releas O Referre
 (b)(2) internal rules and practice (b)(3) Section 102A(i)(1), № (b)(3) Section 6, Central Interpretation (b)(5) attorney-client privition (b)(5) attorney work production (b)(5) deliberative process (b)(5) presidential communication (b)(6) personal privacy 	(including confidential sources) actices National Security Act of 1947, as amended (sources and methods) stelligence Agency Act of 1949, as amended (sources and methods) stelligence Agency Act of 1949, as amended (organizational information) stelligence Agency Act of 1949, as amended (functions) stelligence Agency Act of 1949, as amended (names) stelligence Agency Act of 1949, as amended (official titles) sege	
stification Category IDs:		
. D intion:		

Document Description:

This document is 51 pages total and consists of a series of separate and distinct memorandums, one of which is responsive to Item 5. The responsive portion of this document is a 6-page CIA memorandum from the CIA to Dr. Henry A. Kissinger about a Vietnamese Communist prisoner exchange overture. The document reveals information about human sources, internal CIA control markings, numbers, dissemination control information in addition to names of individuals all of which have been properly withheld. The substantive portion of this document has been released. It is currently and properly classified SECRET.

EshibiTB

C.A. No. 04-0819

This document is withheld in part on the basis of FOIA Exemptions (b)(1), (b)(3) and (b)(6).

Exemption (b)(1): This document is withheld in part on the basis of FOIA exemption (b)(1). This document contains information relating to intelligence activities, sources and methods, foreign relations or foreign activities of the United States that is properly classified pursuant to section 1.4(c) and 1.4(d) of Executive Order 12958, as amended. Disclosure of the information withheld pursuant to exemption (b)(1) reasonably could be expected to cause serious damage to the national security. Additionally, the information withheld pursuant to exemption (b)(1) is exempt from automatic declassification at 25 years under Executive Order 12958, as amended. The CIA has determined that the information withheld pursuant to exemption (b)(1) is also exempt from automatic declassification at 25 years under Executive Order 13526.

Exemption (b)(3): This document is withheld in part on the basis of FOIA exemption (b)(3). This document contains information relating to intelligence sources and methods that is specifically exempted from disclosure pursuant to the National Security Act of 1947, as amended, and the Central Intelligence Agency Act of 1949, as amended, and thus is protected from disclosure by exemption (b)(3). This document also contains CIA internal organizational data, functions, and personnel information that is specifically exempted from disclosure pursuant to the Central Intelligence Agency Act of 1949, and thus is protected from disclosure by exemption (b)(3).

Exemption (b)(6): The CIA withheld certain information from this document pursuant to FOIA exemption (b)(6) on the grounds that the information, if disclosed, would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy of individuals. Specifically, this document contains personal information including the names of individuals. Because this withheld information provides personal identifying information about particular individuals, it is protectable under exemption (b)(6).

The CIA conducted a line-by-line review of this document to determine whether meaningful, reasonably segregable, non-exempt portions of the document could be released. As a result, the CIA is releasing all information that was segregable and not otherwise exempt.

Case Number: Civil Action 04-00814 (HHK) Judge's Initials: HHK Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 3 of 54

Case 1	1:04-cv-0081 4-R CL	Document 182-2	Filed 06/2 6/1 2 I	Page 4 of 54	
					□ F
			·		
	•				
••				-	
•	,				•

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 5 of 54

•	Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/	12 Page 7 of 54
. •		
•		•

.



CENTRAL INTELLIGENCE FREENCY

WASHINGTON, D.C. ECODE

OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR

29 October 1971

MEMORANDUM FOR: Dr. Henry A. Kissinger

Assistant to the President for National Security Affairs

SUBJECT

: Background Data Possibly Relevant to the Current Vietnamese Communist Prisoner

Exchange Overture

1. The current Vietnamese Communist overtures on possible prisoner exchanges, covered in our memoranda of 27 and 28 October, seems to relate to the earlier BUTTERCUP activity that began in August 1967. We have checked the voluminous BUTTERCUP file and found three items of possible relevance. The pertinent traffic should be contained in your records, but in the interests of time and convenience we are repeating it here.

2. The January 1968 Letters. On 3 January 1968, then Deputy Assistant Secretary of Defense (ISA) Richard Steadman was given five letters prepared in Washington for passage to five American citizens believed to be in VC hands. The pertinent message here is Secretary sador Bunker transmitted on 3 January 1968 as

(b)(1)

(b)(3)

(b)(6)

"Five letters to US personnel who may be held by VC being carried by Steadman for delivery to Calhoun. Steadman traveling with General William Depuy. ETA Saigon 1330 local January 4 on Braniff military charter flight 241. In view shortness of time suggest envelope be picked up from Steadman upon arrival Saigon.

- 2 -

4. The February 1968 List. In January and February 1968 there was much discussion about giving the courier for passage to Tran Bach Dang a list of US prisoners whose release we desired as part of any exchange. The most important message here is Secretary Rusk's 7 February 1968 cable to Ambassador Bunker transmitted as CAS

"List of names to send to should be drawn from list of US prisoners we have identified as held by the VC (18 at present). Since has been specific with his lists we believe we should also be precise. We recognize problem of choosing among prisoners, and accordingly propose that we select those who have been held two years or longer. This would be a total of ten names: five officers, four EM, one civilian. There is a time gap of eight months between the most recent capture on the list of ten (January 1966) and the next most recent captures (August 1966). From released prisoners we know that the longer a man is held, the more likely he is to be seriously ill. In the absence of reliable information on the health of individual prisoners, a selection by duration of captivity appears to be fairest. Accordingly, the following list should be sent with the request that at least three of the named prisoners be released. Message should also

the named prisoners be released. Message should also state that we would particularly like to have any prisoners who may be seriously sick or injured, whether or not their names are on list. (Date in each case is date of capture, and should not be transmitted to VC.)

Begin list:

T/Sgt Samuel Adams, AF, 31 Oct 65
Capt. Donald Gilbert Cook, MC, 31 Dec 64
Capt. William Forbes Eisenbraun, Army,
6 July 65
Pvt. Robert Russell Garwood, MC, 28 Sept 65
Capt. Lawrence Thomas Holland, AF,
12 June 65
SP/4 James Henry McLean, Army, 9 Feb 65

SECRET

M/Sgt Thomas Mcore, AF, 31 Oct 65
Douglas K. Ramsey, Civ., 17 Jan 66
Capt. James Nicholas Rowe, Army,
29 Oct 63
Capt. Floyd James Thompson, Army,
26 Mar 64

"Believe we should inform Thieu of plan to send list and give him opportunity to provide similar list of ARVN prisoners."

6. The January 1969 List. In a later BUTTERCUP development, on 30 January 1969 Secretary Rogers sent Ambassador Bunker the following list of twenty names "suitable to give to VC with request that they release ten of them in exchange for the four they have requested." info copies to Dr. Kissinger and Secretary Laird):

TSGT Samuel Adams, 18554000, AF,
October 31, 1965
Michael D. Benge, Civilian,
January 31, 1968
SGT Richard Gordon Burgess, 2084229, MC,
September 25, 1966
MAJ Donald Gilbert Cook, 072794, MC,
December 31, 1964

SECRET

SECRET

Gary Daves, Villan, January 31, 1968 1st LT David Ronald Devers, 05321911, Army, August 13, 1966

TSGT Charles Gale Dusing, 17203698, AF, October 31, 1965 SGT Edwin Russel Grissett, Jr., 1938579, MC, January 22, 1966 MAJ Lawrence Thomas Holland, 57577, AF, June 12, 1965 Philip W. Manhard, Civilian, January 31, 1968 SP4 James Henry McLean, 19722072, Army, February 9, 1965 MSGT Thomas Moore, 14268347, AF, October 31, 1965 SFC John Joseph O'Neill, 11212494, Army, August 13, 1966 Thomas W. Ragsdale, Civilian, January 31, 1968 Douglas Ramsey, Civilian, January 17, 1966 SP5 Edward Daniel Reilly, Jr., 23933241, Army, April 26, 1966 CAPT Floyd James Thompson, 05304076, Army, March 26, 1964 Eugene Weaver, Civilian, January 31, 1968 Charles Willis, Civilian, January 31, 1968

7

the above list

of twenty names was never passed to the Communists. Three of the names on the February 1968 list of ten were not included in the January 1969 list of twenty: US Army Captain Rowe, who escaped on 31 December 1968, US Army Captain William E. Eisenbraun (also an addressee of one of the five January 1968 letters) and USMC Private Robert R.. Garwood.

8. I am sending copies of this memorandum on an eyes only basis to the other three recipients of my 27 and 28 October memoranda, namely, Secretary Rogers, Secretary Laird and Admiral Moorer.

Richard Helms
Director

SEGRET

cc: Secretary Rogers
Secretary Laird
Admiral Moorer

DCI/SAVA
Distribution

1 - ER

1 - DDP

1 - C/FE

290ct71

C03336690Case 1:04-cv-00814-R(CL Document 1	32-2 Filed 06/20/12	Page 15 of 54	. 55
	•			
				٠
	·			
		·		

NR

_

THE REPORTED THE PROPERTY OF T

SECTION OF THE PROPERTY OF THE

parabase franches caracteristication and the second of the best supplied to the best of the figure o

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 31 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 32 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 33 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 34 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 35 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 36 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 37 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 38 of 54

7	Case 1:04-cv-008	14-RCL	Documen	t 182-2	Filed 06/20/1	2 Page 39	of 54	
						,		
		·						
			•					
							·	
		÷						
								-

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 40 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 41 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 42 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 45 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 48 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 49 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 50 of 54

Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL Document 182-2 Filed 06/20/12 Page 51 of 54

	Case 1:04-cv-00814-RCL			~9		
		•				
ž.						
						. •
		•				
	•					
						-
. •						
					•	
•						
				•		
			11,	•	•	

	SECHÉT			
فن				
		PAGE:	0021	
	NQUIRE=DOC6D			
	TEM NO=00348392 DS			
	04763CIA 095148 082335ZMSP	F		HID
H			1	JPI
	/25/25 PER ORIGINATOR /32 SECRET FRP:	, , , ,	, , ,	
	MILITAR	RY		
	*			
	PAGE 001			
	TOT: 082335Z MAR 90			
CC	ONTROLS		·	
	E C R E T			
90	82335Z			
TC	O: PRIORITY DIA WASHINGTON DC//PW-MIA (ATTN. COL. JOE SCHLATTE	ER).	•	
SE	EERET		• • •	
BC	ODX			
St	UBJECT: AMERICAN POW/Mla LIVING IN LAOS CORRECTION			
_	C O R R E C T I O N THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLED UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE		•	
- SE	C O R R E C T I O N THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLE SENT UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE PLEASE CORRECT ALL FILES. THE TEXT DOES NOT			
SE	C O R R E C T I O N THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLED UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE PLEASE CORRECT ALL FILES. THE TEXT DOES NOT THANGE			
SE	C O R R E C T I O N THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLE SENT UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE PLEASE CORRECT ALL FILES. THE TEXT DOES NOT			
- SE	C O R R E C T I O N THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLED WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLED THE UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE PLEASE CORRECT ALL FILES. THE TEXT DOES NOT THANGE			
SE	C O R R E C T I O N THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLED UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE PLEASE CORRECT ALL FILES. THE TEXT DOES NOT THANGE			
SE	C O R R E C T I O N THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLED WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLED THE UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE PLEASE CORRECT ALL FILES. THE TEXT DOES NOT THANGE			
SE CH	CORRECTION THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLENT UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE PLEASE CORRECT ALL FILES. THE TEXT DOES NOT THANGE 1. THIS INFORMATION WAS TO BE PASSED TO STONY BEACH AND JCRO 2. ACCORDING TO 25 JANUARY 1990, THERE ARE NO MERICAN POW/MIA'S LEFT IN LAOS, EXCEPT FOR ONE AMERICAN WHO MA LAO WOMAN AND RESIDES IN HOUAPHAN PROVINCE. THE GOVERNMENT OF ALL ITS AMERICAN POW/MIA'S TO VIETNAM IN 982/1983 (SIC) BECAUSE THERE WAS NO PLACE IN LOSS TO DETAIN THE SIPHON SAID HE DOES NOT KNOW THE NUMBER OF AMERICANS THE GOL TU	RRIED F THE EM. RNED		
AN A LI 19 S: OV P! NO K: FO	C O R R E C T I O N THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLED UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE PLEASE CORRECT ALL FILES. THE TEXT DOES NOT THIS INFORMATION WAS TO BE PASSED TO STONY BEACH AND JCRO 2. ACCORDING TO 25 JANUARY 1990, THERE ARE NO MERICAN POW/MIA'S LEFT IN LAOS, EXCEPT FOR ONE AMERICAN WHO MA LAO WOMAN AND RESIDES IN HOUAPHAN PROVINCE. THE GOVERNMENT OF ALL ITS AMERICAN POW/MIA'S TO VIETNAM IN 1982/1983 (SIC) BECAUSE THERE WAS NO PLACE IN LAOS TO DETAIN THE	RRIED F THE EM. RNED OES 420	C-6	
AN A LII 19 S. OV P! NO K.	CORRECTION THIS IS A REISSUE OF WHICH WAS INADVERTENTLENT UNDER THIS NUMBER. THE CORRECT NUMBER SHOULD BE PLEASE CORRECT ALL FILES. THE TEXT DOES NOT HANGE 1. THIS INFORMATION WAS TO BE PASSED TO STONY BEACH AND JCRO 2. ACCORDING TO 25 JANUARY 1990, THERE ARE NO MERICAN POW/MIA'S LEFT IN LAOS, EXCEPT FOR ONE AMERICAN WHO MAY LAO WOMAN AND RESIDES IN HOUAPHAN PROVINCE. THE GOVERNMENT OF POW (GOL) TURNED OVER ALL ITS AMERICAN POW/MIA'S TO VIETNAM IN 1982/1983 (SIC) BECAUSE THERE WAS NO PLACE IN LAOS TO DETAIN THE SIPHON SAID HE DOES NOT KNOW THE NUMBER OF AMERICANS THE GOL TURNER TO VIETNAM, BUT HE KNOWS THAT THEY ARE BEING DETAINED AT A PLACE THAT IS 420 KILOMETERS AWAY FROM HANOI, ALTHOUGH SIPHON DOT KNOW IN WHICH DIRECTION. (COMMENT: IF THE PLACE IS INDEED CILOMETERS FROM HANOI, IT WOULD HAVE TO BE SOMEWHERE IN WHAT WAS FORMERLY SOUTH VIETNAM. THE LPDR WAS FORMALLY ESTABLISHED IN	RRIED F THE EM. RNED OES 420	C-6	

CIA-900308-630I

7